



34 CARLTON STREET

J.L. BATHGATE HOUSE

PREPARED BY PETERSON PROJECTS – JANUARY 2007



34 CARLTON STREET JAMES L. BATHGATE HOUSE

Date of Construction: 1905

Building Permit: 770/1905

Architect: Russell, John Hamilton Gordon

Contractor: Hislop, J. and Neil, J.H.

ARCHITECTURAL INTEREST:

One of the dwindling number of large, pre-1915 single family dwellings found in the east Broadway area is this home, built for one of Winnipeg's successful businessmen whose company which he helped found is still part of the Winnipeg scene today. The 2½-storey frame building is constructed with common clay brick veneer walls resting on a stone foundation. Standing on the west side Carlton Street, the home measures approximately 9.9 x 11.9 metres (32½ x 39 feet) and cost \$7,000 to complete in 1905.¹

The main (east) façade of this building includes a wealth of ornamental features including: the raised rusticated stone base; the bay window with square headed windows accented by radiating brick heads and stone lug sills; the front facing gable end with its oversized wood brackets, half-timbering and plain wood bargeboard; the enclosed porch with front facing gable end with half-timbering; the overhanging eaves with exposed wood rafters; and the



Front (east) and north façades, 2006

steeply pitched truncated hip roof with hipped gable dormer (also with exposed rafters). The enclosed porch would likely have originally been open and usually included a wealth of ornamental woodwork.

The south side of the home features many of the same elements as the front: brick walls, bay window, hipped gable dormer, gable end with half-timbering and eaves with exposed rafters. One unusual feature is a pointed arched window with intersecting tracery on the ground floor. A frame addition attached to this side is used as an entrance porch. A metal fire escape leads from the dormer to the rear of the building and then to the ground.

The north elevation is flat and includes both arched and square headed window openings and another gable end with wood brackets and half-timbering and eaves with exposed rafters. The rear of the building features a bay window, ornate wood bracketing, arched and flat headed window openings, a hipped gable dormer and a two-storey enclosed section.

It is an attractive structure designed to compliment the other large homes on Carlton Street and the other streets in the neighbourhood.

Tudor-style homes were constructed throughout Winnipeg and North America from the 1890s until World War II. The style is loosely based on a number of late Medieval English structures ranging from thatch-roofed cottages to grand mansions. In North America, the style developed several distinctive elements - ornamental half-timbering, steeply pitched roofs, front-facing gables, and stucco, masonry or masonry-veneered walls.²



Front (east) and south façades, 2006

The most common feature of Tudor homes is a steeply pitched central roof with cross gables. Tall, narrow windows in multiple groups and massive chimneys crowned by chimney pots are other common elements. About half of all examples of the style contain decorative (non-structural) half-timbering with stucco or brick infill.³

Building architect J.H.G. Russell was born in Toronto, Canada West (Ontario), in 1862, the son of a dry goods dealer. After attending school in that city, he went to work for H.B. Gordon, a prominent area architect. Russell was with Gordon from 1878 until his departure for Winnipeg in 1882. From 1886 to 1893, Russell travelled throughout the United States, learning civil engineering, surveying and architecture in centres such as Chicago, Illinois, Spokane and Tacoma, Washington, and Sioux City, Iowa.

In 1895, two years after returning to Winnipeg, he set up his private practice, coinciding with the city's period of unbridled growth. His designs were (and are) scattered throughout the city, province and Western Canada, covering a variety of building types, sizes, costs and uses. His business continued to be steady during World War I and after, when many architects struggled to find commissions.

Russell was president of the Manitoba Association of Architects (1925) and served for three terms as the president of the Royal Architectural Institute of Canada (1912-15). His chairmanship of the Presbyterian Church Board of Managers and his devotion to Presbyterianism partially explain the large number of churches he designed for the denomination in Winnipeg and Western Canada. Russell died in 1946.



Detail of southeast corner, 2006

A complete list of his designs would be very lengthy, included among his more notable local projects would be J.H. Ashdown Warehouse additions, 157-179 Bannatyne Avenue, (1899-1911, Grade II), Lake of the Woods Building, 212 McDermot Avenue (1901, Grade II), Hammond Building, 63 Albert Street (1902, Grade III), Adelman Building, 92-100 Princess Street (1903, Grade II), Franklin Press, 168 Bannatyne Avenue (1904, Grade III), R.R. Wilson, 545 Broadway (1904, Grade III), J.H. Ashdown Store, 211 Bannatyne Avenue (1904, Grade III), Porter Building, 165 McDermot Avenue (1906, Grade III), Child's (McArthur) Building, Portage Avenue (1909, demolished), Casa Loma Building, Portage Avenue (1909, Grade II), Glengarry Block, 290 McDermot Avenue (1910, Grade III), Westminster Presbyterian (United) Church, 745 Westminster Avenue (1910-12, Grade II), Dingwall Building, 62 Albert Street (1911, Grade III), YMCA, 301 Vaughan Street, with Jackson and Rosencrans of New York (1911-13, Grade II), J.H. Ashdown, 529 Wellington Crescent (1913, Grade II) and St. John's Presbyterian (United) Church, 250 Cathedral Avenue (1923, Grade III). He has been given 20 points by the Historical Buildings Committee.

HISTORICAL INTEREST:

The area was known, starting in the 1880s, as The Hudson's Bay Reserve or The Reserve, and developed into one of Winnipeg's earliest prestigious residential neighbourhoods. It filled with the mansions and large homes and manicured grounds of Winnipeg's business and social elite. For the next several decades, it was one of the most desirable addresses in all of Western Canada, with tree-lined Broadway running down its centre. This residential



Rear (west) façade, 2006

activity fostered the development of related facilities such as churches, schools and terraces.

As Winnipeg's downtown expanded, many of the city's elite chose to relocate further away in rapidly developing neighbourhoods such as Armstrong's Point, River Heights, Fort Rouge, Crescentwood and Wolseley. Many of The Reserve's original properties were subdivided, allowing more modest infill housing to dot the streets and avenues. Many of the larger dwellings were converted into boarding houses, their interiors seriously altered. A relatively new form of housing, the apartment block, also found expression in The Reserve through the construction of luxury blocks on both sides of Broadway and on cross streets. Again, as time progressed, smaller, less ostentatious blocks were built in the area.

James L. Bathgate, co-founder of the Scott-Bathgate Company in 1903, was the original owner of this home.⁴ The Scott-Bathgate Company was founded by A.E. Scott and J.L. Bathgate, manufacturers and distributors of confectionaries including the famous "Nutty Club" brand and the "CAN D MAN" logo still in use today. The rapid expansion of the business in the pre-World War I era necessitated a large warehouse/factory complex built between 1905 and 1907 on the west side of Westbrook Street between Portage Avenue East and Pioneer Avenue. It was illustrative of the positive situation many companies enjoyed in Winnipeg, taking full advantage of the city's geographic location between manufacturers and markets and the favourable freight rates that supported the City's wholesale trade. The company also expanded after the Great Depression, necessitating the occupation of a nearby warehouse at 80 Lombard Avenue and continues to occupy these buildings today.⁵



Rear (west) and north façades, 2006

Bathgate continued to live in the home into the 1920s. By 1930, the property was owned and occupied by Mrs. Olive B. Scott (employment not listed). In 1960, Foundation Finance and Investment Limited owned the property and it appears to have been converted into a boarding house, a fate suffered by many of the old mansions in Winnipeg's downtown. A 1960 directory lists 11 suites and in 1970 the building is named the Margo Apartments. By 1980 the structure had been converted into offices (another fairly common fate for large homes), occupied by chartered accountants and lawyers.⁶



Detail of north façade, 2006

RECOMMENDATION TO HISTORICAL BUILDINGS COMMITTEE:

Under the Historical Buildings By-law, this building meets a number of important criteria:

- its historical importance- one of a handful of pre-1915 built single-family dwellings in the east Broadway area known as The Reserve and an excellent example of a home built for an affluent family at the turn of the century;
- its associations- its long-term connections to early and influential businessman James L. Bathgate;
- its design- an excellent example of a Tudor style residence;
- its architect- J.H.G. Russell was a respected and important local practitioner;
- its location- contributes greatly to the historic streetscape of Carlton Street; and
- its integrity- its façades continue to display many of their original elements and design.



Scott-Bathgate Building, 149 Pioneer Avenue, northwest corner Westbrook Street, built in 1905 and still used by the company today, 2006



Famous “CAN D MAN” logo of the Scott-Bathgate Company

(Reproduced from <http://www.scottbathgate.com/>)

ENDNOTES:

- 1 City of Winnipeg Building Permit, #770/1905.
- 2 V. and L. McAlester, A Field Guide to American Houses (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, Inc., 1984), p. 358.
- 3 Ibid., pp. 355-356.
- 4 City of Winnipeg Assessment Rolls, Roll No. 12-092632000 (below as ARo), 1905-1910.
- 5 Business information courtesy of www.scottbathgate.com.
- 6 ARo, 1910-1990; and Henderson's Directory, 1910-1990.