December 27, 2018

Re: Your request for access to information under Part 2 of The
Freedom of Information and Protection of Privacy Act: Request
Number 18 11 1129

On November 26, 2018, the City of Winnipeg City Clerk’s Department received your request for access to the following records:

All records, emails and correspondence in 2018 relating to the "Winnipeg Hollywood Sign" that was placed at Westview Park in September of 2018

During our telephone conversation on December 3, 2018, you had clarified that you were referring to the “Garbage Hill” sign and understood the Public Works Department’s Parks and Open Spaces operations and therefore modified your request to include:

Public Works Department records, emails and correspondence in 2018 relating to the discovery removal and possible replacement of the "Garbage Hill" sign that was placed at Westview Park in September of 2018. Please also include council office for records regarding replacement.

Subsequently and as part of our Duty to Assist under section 9 of the Freedom of Information and Protection of Privacy Act, on December 19, 2018 we had further discussed modifying your request to only Public Works Department records which included:

Public Works Department records, emails and correspondence in 2018 relating to the discovery removal and possible replacement of the "Garbage Hill" sign that was placed at Westview Park in September of 2018.
Duty to assist applicant

9 The head of a public body shall make every reasonable effort to assist an applicant and to respond without delay, openly, accurately and completely.

I am pleased to inform you that your request has been granted in part. Access to a portion of the record has been severed under s. 23(1)(a) of the Act, which specifically protects information that was provided as advice, opinions, proposals, recommendations, analyses, or policy options developed for the public body.

Advice to a public body

23(1) The head of a public body may refuse to disclose information to an applicant if disclosure could reasonably be expected to reveal

(a) advice, opinions, proposals, recommendations, analyses or policy options developed by or for the public body or a minister;

Subsequently, portions of this document contained information not responsive to this request. As such, these areas of the record were severed as ‘Non-Responsive Information’.

As required by subsection 7(2) of The Act, we have severed information that is protected from disclosure and have provided you with as much information as possible.

7(2) - The right of access to a record does not extend to information that is excepted from disclosure under Division 3 or 4 of this Part, but if that information can reasonably be severed from the record, an applicant has a right of access to the remainder of the record.

As you requested a copy of these records, and as they can be reasonably reproduced, in accordance with clause 14(1)(a) of The Freedom of Information and Protection of Privacy Act, a copy of the records is enclosed.

14(1) - Subject to subsection 7(2), the right of access is met under this Part

(a) if the applicant has asked for a copy and the record can reasonably be reproduced, by giving the applicant a copy of the record.

Subsection 59(1) of The Freedom of Information and Protection of Privacy Act provides that you may make a complaint to the Manitoba Ombudsman about this decision.
You have 60 days from the receipt of this letter to make a complaint on the prescribed form to:

Manitoba Ombudsman
750 - 500 Portage Avenue
Winnipeg MB R3C 3X1
204-982-9130
1-800-665-0531

If you have any questions, please contact me at (204) 986-3041, by email at ssmith@winnipeg.ca, or by mail at the address below.

Sincerely,

Shelly Smith
Records and Information Management Coordinator
Public Works Department

c.c. K. Krahn, Corporate Access and Privacy Officer
Good afternoon, everyone.

This is a summary of media inquiries and releases of information handled through Corporate Communications today. 

Non-Responsive
Public Works

Garbage Hill Sign (Update to September 11 Summary)
Jake Edmiston/National Post sent: I'm writing about the removal of the Garbage Hill sign today, and I am hoping to speak with Mayor Bowman for a few minutes about the whole thing.
I am on a 4 p.m. EST deadline today, so would love to hear from you shortly.

In consultation with the Department, CorpComm provided the following response:
The public service was made aware of the sign over the weekend and upon inspection on Monday, department officials had safety concerns around its construction and the materials used. The sign, which was not installed with any permits or City approval, was then removed by staff later that afternoon.

Reporter followed-up with:

Q: What kind of safety concerns?
A: As mentioned, the construction of the sign and the materials used presented safety concerns for an installation at a public park.

Q: Has the creator of the sign reached out to the city to go through the proper process in re-installing the sign, as the mayor suggested?
A: Not that we’re aware of at this time.

Q: Now, just to double back, why was the construction and materials of the sign considered a safety risk? What about them was so risky? Was its structure unsound? Were the edges too sharp? Was the material used found to be a biohazard?
A: As noted, the construction of the sign and the materials used presented safety concerns for an installation at a public park. The sign was constructed with two 2x4’s mounted into the ground, and the frame was constructed of 1x1 scrap wood. The letters were constructed with drywall (would likely not have withstood heavy rain). Screws and nails were also protruding from the sign.

Garbage Hill Sign
Bartley Kives/CBC sent: Please ask parks to confirm it was drywall. I have been told this by a city official, but I’d like it confirmed. Thanks. A drywall sign would have dissolved in the first heavy rain. If it’s not drywall, let me know what it was.

In consultation with the Department, CorpComm provided the following response via email:
It was drywall.

Reporter followed-up with: Entirely?

A: The sign was constructed with two 2x4’s mounted into the ground, and the frame was constructed of 1x1 scrap wood. The letters were constructed with drywall (would likely not have withstood heavy rain). Screws and nails were also protruding from the sign.

Beth Macdonell/CTV sent: Since Mayor Brian Bowman’s comments about supporting the sign with the right approval, has anyone come forward to the city to ask if it can be re-installed?

What else have you learned about the sign?

How many calls to 311 and other departments have you had about the sign?

Thanks so much for your help and look forward to your reply.

In consultation with the Department, CorpComm provided the following response:
“The construction of the sign and the materials used presented safety concerns for an installation at a public park. The sign was constructed with two 2x4’s mounted into the ground, and the frame was constructed of 1x1 scrap wood. The letters were constructed with drywall (would likely not have withstood heavy rain). Screws and nails were also protruding from the sign.

At this time, no one has formally approached the City about installing a sign at that location.”

Non-Responsive
Smith, Shelly

From: Driedger, David
Sent: Wednesday, September 12, 2018 10:46 AM
To: Allen, Ken; Andronak, Brett; Arabsky, Ryan; Bailey, Neil; Bauer, Cindy; Beck, Karen; Berezowsky, Jim; Blazewicz, Dennis; Borland, Jonathan; Boryskavich, Krista; Bowers, Deborah; Boyce, Kenny; Cenerini, Yvette; Chambers, Mel; Chammartin, Joseph; Chartier, Georges; Chaves, Pam; Chestnut, Tricia; City-MedialInquiry; Clark, Alissa; D'Avignon, Barb; Davis, Jeremy; Dryburgh, Matt; Ewankiw, Greg; Fernandes, Cindy; Forgues, Rhonda; Gameiro, Carlos; Geddes, Natalie; Geer, Moira; Giles, Micheal; Gilmour, Lisa; Gordon, Leland; Heather, Grant; Hildebrand, Jonathan; Ives, Aaron; Jack, Michael; Jasper, Brenda; Kachur, Richard; Kiernan, John; Kirby, Robert; Kristjansson, Rob; Lane, John; Legary, Michael; Lemoine, Marc; Mangahas, Rica; Mansky, Bryan; Markowsky, Tyler; Marquardson, Lisa; McCrae, Kelly; McKim, Ken; McLure, Kristen; McNeil, Doug; Miller, Lea-Ann; Murray, Jay; Olafson, Paul; Olson, Donna; Shaw, Jason; Schmidt, Christian; Shields, Kelly; Smith, Shannay; Smith, Shelly; Sokal, Ashley; Stewart, Colin; Tackie, Angela; Tonog, Jemuel; Topolniski, Randy (WPA); Vespa, Morgan; Wardrop, Dave; Weimer, Michelle; Williams, Ajaleigh; WPS-Public Information Officer; Young, Nicole; Krahn, Konrad; Dick, Harold; Forlanski, Tamara; Qually, Kalen; Schmidt, Joelle; Madden, Erin; Shaw, Jason; Dehn, Kelly; Carver, Robert; Wiltshire, Felicia; Wallace, Tom; Drohomereski, Russ; Driedger, David

Subject: Media Summary - Tuesday, September 11, 2018

Good afternoon, everyone.

This is a summary of media inquiries and releases of information handled through Corporate Communications yesterday.

Non-Responsive
Non-Responsive
Garbage Hill Sign
Jake Edmiston/National Post sent:
I'm writing about the removal of the Garbage Hill sign today, and I am hoping to speak with Mayor Bowman for a few minutes about the whole thing.
I am on a 4 p.m. EST deadline today, so would love to hear from you shortly.

In consultation with the Department, CorpComm provided the following response:
The public service was made aware of the sign over the weekend and upon inspection on Monday, department officials had safety concerns around its construction and the materials used. The sign, which was not installed with any permits or City approval, was then removed by staff later that afternoon.

Reporter followed-up with:

Q: What kind of safety concerns?

A: As mentioned, the construction of the sign and the materials used presented safety concerns for an installation at a public park.

Q: Has the creator of the sign reached out to the city to go through the proper process in re-installing the sign, as the mayor suggested?

A: Not that we’re aware of at this time.

Q: Now, just to double back, why was the construction and materials of the sign considered a safety risk? What about them was so risky? Was its structure unsound? Were the edges too sharp? Was the material used found to be a biohazard?

(In Progress)
Jonina Ewart
Park Services Administrator
Public Works
P: 204-986-2682

-----Original Message-----
From: Ewart, Jonina
Sent: Wednesday, September 12, 2018 9:27 AM
To: Berezowsky, Jim
Subject: RE: Garbage Hill

2x4 - posts
1x1- frame
White painted Drywall letters screwed and nailed into foam and backed with 2nd piece of drywall. (sandwiched drywall with foam insulation)

Jonina Ewart
Park Services Administrator
Public Works
P: 204-986-2682

-----Original Message-----
From: Berezowsky, Jim
Sent: Wednesday, September 12, 2018 9:11 AM
To: Ewart, Jonina
Subject: Garbage Hill

Hello Jonina,

Can you confirm quickly what the material actually was on that sign?

You mentioned drywall, I need to confirm quickly what it was.

Jim

Sent from my iPhone
Good morning.
Sign was installed sometime on the weekend and was removed Monday ~15:00. (likely our 24 hours is covered)
Sign was constructed with 2 2x4’s mounted into the ground and the frame was constructed of 1x1 scrap wood.
The letters were constructed with drywall (likely not a material that would have withstood last night’s rain).
Screws and nails were protruding and structure was NOT SAFE.

Sign is not salvageable nor would construction of this type be safe to be installed in a city park.
From: Jack, Michael  
Sent: Tuesday, September 11, 2018 9:34 AM  
To: Wiltshire, Felicia  
Cc: Wardrop, Dave; Berezowsky, Jim; Ewart, Jonina  
Subject: Re: Garbage Hill Sign

Jim,

23(1)(a)

Thanks,
Mike

Sent from my iPad

On Sep 10, 2018, at 8:56 PM, Wiltshire, Felicia <fwiltshire@winnipeg.ca> wrote:

23(1)(a)

______________________________________________________________________
Felicia Wiltshire  
Director, Customer Service & Communications  
City of Winnipeg  
P: 204.986.5303  
C: 204.806.4793  
E: fwiltshire@winnipeg.ca

On Sep 10, 2018, at 4:47 PM, Wardrop, Dave <DWardrop@winnipeg.ca> wrote:
Thanks.

Dave Wardrop  
Chief Transportation and Utilities Officer  
P: 204-986-4469

From: Wiltshire, Felicia  
Sent: Monday, September 10, 2018 4:14 PM  
To: Jack, Michael; Berezowsky, Jim; Wardrop, Dave  
Subject: RE: Garbage Hill Sign

FYI ...all that we said to media was that it was removed because it was installed without proper approvals...

Felicia Wiltshire  
Director, Customer Service & Communications  
P: 204-986-5303  
M: 204-806-4793

From: Jack, Michael  
Sent: Monday, September 10, 2018 4:09 PM  
To: Berezowsky, Jim; Wardrop, Dave  
Cc: Wiltshire, Felicia  
Subject: RE: Garbage Hill Sign

Jim,

Please nonetheless ask them to keep it (as intact as possible) while we discuss next steps.

MJ

Michael A. Jack  
Chief Corporate Services Officer  
P: 204-986-2566  
M: 204-250-5657

From: Berezowsky, Jim  
Sent: Monday, September 10, 2018 4:03 PM  
To: Jack, Michael; Wardrop, Dave  
Subject: Fwd: Garbage Hill Sign

FYI

Sent from my iPhone

Begin forwarded message:

From: "Ewart, Jonina" <JEwart@winnipeg.ca>  
Date: September 10, 2018 at 4:01:04 PM CDT
To: "Berezowsky, Jim" <JBerezowsky@winnipeg.ca>
Subject: RE: Garbage Hill Sign

Sign was damaged...apparently the sign broke (in half), as they were trying to manoeuver it out of its location.

Jonina Ewart
Park Services Administrator
Public Works
P: 204-986-2682

From: Berezowsky, Jim
Sent: Monday, September 10, 2018 3:55 PM
To: Ewart, Jonina
Subject: Garbage Hill Sign

Hello Jonina,

Rumour is that a Garbage Hill sign was placed at Garbage Hill and taken down by our staff, I hope our staff did not destroy it.

Jim Berezowsky
Director
Public Works
City of Winnipeg

Email: jberezowsky@winnipeg.ca
Website: winnipeg.ca

CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE: The information contained in this message is intended solely for the person or entity to which it is addressed and may contain confidential and/or privileged information. Any use, dissemination, distribution, copying or disclosure of this message and attachments, in whole or in part, by anyone other than the intended recipient is strictly prohibited. If you have received this message in error, please notify the sender and permanently delete the complete message and any attachments. Thank you.
Jonina Ewart
Park Services Administrator
Public Works
P: 204-986-2682

From: Johnson, Andy
Sent: Tuesday, September 11, 2018 8:06 AM
To: Ewart, Jonina
Cc: Houldsworth, James
Subject: RE: Garbage Hill Sign

Hi Jonina,

I just received a call from the foreman at Midland yard and unfortunately the sign broke apart when it was removed.

The sign may have looked nice but up close it wasn’t so pristine.

Apparently it didn’t survive last night’s rain as it was made of gyprock and crumbled.

There is nothing that is salvageable.

Andy

From: Ewart, Jonina
Sent: Monday, September 10, 2018 4:50 PM
To: Johnson, Andy
Subject: Fwd: Garbage Hill Sign

Jonina

Begin forwarded message:

From: "Berezowsky, Jim" <Jberezowsky@winnipeg.ca>
Date: September 10, 2018 at 4:25:50 PM CDT
To: "Ewart, Jonina" <JEwart@winnipeg.ca>
Subject: Re: Garbage Hill Sign

Hello Jonina,
Keep it as is for the moment in case they want it back.

Thanks,
Jim

Sent from my iPhone

On Sep 10, 2018, at 4:01 PM, Ewart, Jonina <jEwart@winnipeg.ca> wrote:

Sign was damaged...apparently the sign broke (in half), as they were trying to manoeuver it out of its location.

Jonina Ewart
Park Services Administrator
Public Works
P: 204-986-2682

From: Berezowsky, Jim
Sent: Monday, September 10, 2018 3:55 PM
To: Ewart, Jonina
Subject: Garbage Hill Sign

Hello Jonina,

Rumour is that a Garbage Hill sign was placed at Garbage Hill and taken down by our staff, I hope our staff did not destroy it.

Jim Berezowsky
Director
Public Works
City of Winnipeg
Email: jberezowsky@winnipeg.ca
Website: winnipeg.ca

Connect with us: